

**ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH**

<b>Title:</b>	<b>Final Minutes - Dublin Meeting</b>
<b>Date:</b>	<b>20 October 2007</b>
<b>Meeting Venue:</b>	<b>Best Western Royal Dublin Hotel 40 Upper O'Connell Street Dublin</b>
<b>Contact email:</b>	<a href="mailto:accreditation@accreditation-services.com">accreditation@accreditation-services.com</a> <a href="mailto:h.bonafos@accreditation-services.com">h.bonafos@accreditation-services.com</a>

**DRAFT MINUTES OF DUBLIN MEETING**

14:15 to 14:20 – Welcome and introduction from facilitator of meeting

14:20 to 14:35 – Registration of participants to the Dublin Meeting

- All participants understand and agree to commit themselves towards working together on the development of an FSC national standard for Ireland in line with FSC procedures and requirements through an open and transparent multi-stakeholder process.
- Participants also recognize FSC standards and FSC certification requirements as an appropriate framework for sustainable forest management in Ireland.
- Participants to the meeting:
  - o Hubert de Bonafos as facilitator to the meeting
  - o Caroline Lewis
  - o Kathy Sinnott
  - o Declan Little
  - o Sasha Bosbeer
  - o Stiof MacAmhalghaidh
  - o Ruth McGrath
  - o Alistair Pfeiffer
  - o Steve Harrington
  - o Tony Lowes
  - o Tony Mannion
  - o Rosita Sweetman

**ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH**

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



**ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH**

- Monica Muller
- John Jackson
- Brendan Kelly
- Peter Sweetman
- Andrew St Ledger
- Michael Ewing
- Terence Conway
- Helen Kelly
- Aidan Coocoran
- Stephen Coyne
- 4 Persons coming as observers and presenting themselves as from Tara

**14:35 to 14:40 – Objective of the Dublin Meeting**

- Nomination of 3 representatives to be delegated to a meeting in Bonn where procedures will be agreed to make sure that the development of an FSC national standard for Ireland can move forward through an open and transparent multi-stakeholder process.
- Nomination shall be based on a consensus among all the participants to the Dublin meeting.
- Definition of consensus for this meeting: Lack of sustained objection.

**14:40 to 14:50 – Procedures for the Dublin Meeting**

- 1 independent facilitator for the meeting.
- A proposed agenda for the meeting was presented at the beginning of the meeting. A copy of this agenda is presented as an annex to these minutes (annex 1).
- Rules have been proposed for the meeting. A copy of these basic rules is attached as an annex to these minutes (annex 2).
- Short minutes for the meeting will be taken by the facilitator and the participants agree that:
  - Points of agreements will be noted.
  - Sustained objection will be recorded and the justification provided will be recorded and included in the minutes.
  - Minutes will be approved at the end of the meeting.

**ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH**

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



### **ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH**

- Minutes will be available within 48 hours and will be publicly available.
- No other public statement will be made by any of the participants.
- Next steps will be agreed at the end of the meeting.

#### 14:50 to 15:30 – Nomination of Environmental Interests representatives

- Michael Ewing had been proposed to represent Environmental Interests at the Bonn Meeting.
- Ruth Mc Grath withdrew her objection to his nomination.
- No other candidate was proposed.
- Michael Ewing presented himself and his past experience.
- Michael Ewing responded to questions from participants.
- It was clarified that representatives nominated for the Bonn meeting will not have a formal role in the process after the Bonn meeting. Their role will be to go to Bonn to seek advice from FSC, discuss and agree on open and transparent procedures for the FSC multi-stakeholder process and to report to all stakeholders in Ireland after the Bonn meeting.
- Following a round of questions to Michael Ewing, there was no indication of sustained opposition but participants did not want to have a formal decision taken at this stage. It was proposed to go through the 3 nominations before a formal decision is taken.

#### 15:30 to 16:20 – Nomination of Social Interests representatives

- Two names had been proposed:
  - Sasha Bosbeer
  - Stiof MacAmhalghaidh.
- Clarification was requested regarding the nomination process for both candidates. Sasha was not aware of the names of the people who supported her nomination and Stiof was not aware of the names of all the groups that supported his nomination.
- Both candidates presented themselves and responded to questions.
- Sustained objection was presented against Sasha Bosbeer for the following reasons:
  - Her support for this nomination was questioned by participants to the meeting.
  - She participated as an observer to an audit performed by Soil Association to a group certificate (An Grupa Dubh Dara).
  - She has been in contact with Woodlands of Ireland. Some participants considered that Woodlands of Ireland is not a social group.

#### **ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH**

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



### **ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH**

- Sustained objection was presented against Stiof MacAmhalghaidh because of the publication on a website of a letter addressed to the FSC.
- Objection was presented against this sustained objection to Stiof MacAmhalghaidh.
- Proposition was made to nominate Steve Harrington to represent Social Interests at the Bonn meeting.
- Sustained objection was presented against this proposal due to a statement made by Steve Harrington during the meeting regarding his objection to a sustained objection to the nomination of Stiof MacAmhalghaidh.
- Decision was taken to allow for a break and start the discussion for the Economic representative after the break. It was agreed that the nomination of the Social representative shall be revisited after a discussion for the nomination of the Economic Interests representative.

16:20 to 16:35 – Coffee Break

16:35 to 17:40 – Nomination of Economic Interests representative

- Two names had been proposed:
  - o Tony Mannion
  - o Joe Gowan (not present at the meeting)
- However Joe Gowan informed that he could not participate to the Bonn meeting for personal reasons.
- A third name is presented during the meeting:
  - o Steve Harrington
- Presentation of the nominations.
- Presentation by each one of the two candidates.
- Sustained opposition against the nomination of Tony Mannion:
  - o Tony Mannion has worked for Coillte.
  - o Tony Mannion has been part of the IFCI process for the last 8 years.
  - o Other issues were also discussed during the meeting and Mr Mannion was questioned on issues such as: copyright of the draft national standard, sustainable forest management, An Grupa Dubh Dara an FSC group certificate.
- Sustained opposition against the nomination of Steve Harrington:

#### **ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH**

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



### ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH

- Statement made by Steve Harrington during the meeting regarding his objection to a sustained objection to the nomination of Stiof MacAmhalghaidh.
- Three proposals were presented to move the process forward and try to reach consensus:
  - Michael Ewing, Stiof MacAmhalghaidh, Tony Mannion to go to Bonn: Sustained opposition expressed against this proposal.
  - Michael Ewing, Stiof MacAmhalghaidh, Steve Harrington to go to Bonn: Sustained opposition expressed against this proposal.
  - Michael Ewing, Sasha Bosbeer, Steve Harrington to go to Bonn: Sustained opposition expressed against this proposal.

17:40 to 17:50 – Break

17:50 to 18:05 – Conclusion of meeting

- After a break, the third option is being discussed again:
  - Michael Ewing
  - Sasha Bosbeer
  - Steve Harrington.
- There is a proposal to submit the nomination of Sasha Bosbeer and Stiof MacAmhalghaidh to a vote by representatives of local communities.
- No agreement around this proposal, but there is agreement that the names of the people who supported the nomination of Sasha Bosbeer will be submitted to Hubert de Bonafos and Kathy Sinnott so that these people can be contacted directly. This list of names will remain confidential unless these people agree specifically for their name to be published.
- **Following discussion, consensus was reached on the following proposal:**
  - **Michael Ewing representing Environmental Interests.**
  - **Sasha Bosbeer representing Social Interests (a list of people with social interests who have supported her nomination will be sent to Hubert de Bonafos and Kathy Sinnott).**
  - **Steve Harrington representing Economic Interests.**
  - **The 3 nominees will go to the Bonn Meeting empty handed with no specific proposal. These nominees will go to Bonn to seek advice from FSC and agree on a set of open and transparent procedures which will allow the process in Ireland to move forward.**

#### ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



**ASI- Accreditation Services International GmbH**

- Hubert de Bonafos will contact the 3 nominees to set a date and organize the Bonn Meeting.
- Hubert de Bonafos will keep Kathy Sinnott and a representative of IFCI steering committee informed and will request these two people to circulate the information to all interested stakeholders.

**ASI – Accreditation Services International GmbH**

Geschäftsführer/Director: Jean-Bernard Lorigny • Sitz der Gesellschaft/Registered Office: Bonn, Germany  
Handelsregister/Commercial Register: Bonn HRB 13790 • Ust.-ID Nr./VAT-No.: DE 814 596 687

Dresdner Bank AG Mönchengladbach, Germany • BLZ/Sort. Code: 310 800 15 Kto-Nr./Acct. No.: 09 086 559 00  
IBAN: DE61 3108 0015 0908 6559 00 • SWIFT-BIC: DRES DE FF 310



**Annex 1**

**DRAFT AGENDA (as of 19-10-2007)**

**ASI-IFCI-NGOs meeting regarding three representatives to participate in Bonn Meeting**

<b>Time</b>	<b>Activity</b>	
<b>14:00 to 14:15</b>	Introduction to the meeting: - Registration of participants - Reasons for the Dublin meeting - Objective of the Dublin meeting	Meeting facilitator: Hubert de Bonafos (ASI)
<b>14:15 to 15:00</b>	Approval of procedures for the meeting	
<b>15:00 to 15:45</b>	Nomination of Environmental Interests representative	
<b>15:45 to 16:30</b>	Nomination of Social Interests representative	
<b>16:30 to 17:15</b>	Nomination of Economic Interests representative	
<b>17:15 to 18:00</b>	Conclusion of meeting Presentation of next steps Review and approval of proposed minutes for the meeting	



**Annex 2**

**GROUND RULES FOR THE MEETING**

- 1 – Speak slowly and only 1 at a time.**
- 2 – Respect each other and respect different visions/perspectives/point of view.**
- 3 – Stay brief, giving others the opportunity to participate.**
- 4 – Truly think of what is best for all stakeholders and sustainable forestry in Ireland.**
- 5 – Keep progressing.**

